

1 G. WHITNEY LEIGH (SBN 153457)  
2 GONZALEZ & LEIGH LLP  
3 744 Montgomery Street, Fifth Floor  
4 San Francisco, CA 94111  
5 Telephone: (415) 912-5950  
6 Facsimile: (415) 912-5951  
7 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
8 DENIZ BOLBOL

9 JOSEPH P. CUVIELLO  
10 P.O. Box 2834  
11 Redwood City, CA 94064  
12 Telephone: (650) 654-9955  
13 Plaintiff In Pro Se

14 STEPHEN M. MACPHAIL, Bar No. 106522  
15 BRAGG & KULUVA  
16 555 S. Flower Street, Suite 600  
17 Los Angeles, California 90071  
18 Telephone: (213) 612-5335  
19 Facsimile: (213) 612-5712  
20 Attorneys for Defendants,  
21 SMG, COUNTY OF ALAMEDA,  
22 RON LITTLE, LEROY "SKEET" ELLIS,  
23 OAKLAND-ALAMEDA COUNTY COLISEUM AUTHORITY  
24 OAKLAND COLISEUM JOINT VENTURE

25 RICHARD M. WILLIAMS  
26 Gray •Duffy, LLP  
27 702 Marshall Street, Suite 600  
28 Redwood City, CA 94063  
Telephone: Office: (650) 365-7343  
Attorneys for Defendants CITY OF OAKLAND  
OAKLAND POLICE OFFICER R. VALLADON,  
OAKLAND POLICE OFFICER R. VILLEGAS

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

JOSEPH P. CUVIELLO AND  
DENIZ BOLBOL, INDIVIDUALLY,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CITY OF OAKLAND, A PUBLIC ENTITY,  
et al.,

Defendants.

Case Nos. 06-cv-05517-EMC  
and 09-cv-02955-EMC

**[PROPOSED] STIPULATED  
PERMANENT INJUNCTION**

## INTRODUCTION

In accordance with the Court's Order Granting Plaintiffs' Motion for Voluntary Dismissal dated November 15, 2012 (*See* Docket 531), Plaintiffs and Defendants jointly submit this proposed Stipulated Permanent Injunction ("Injunction"). The parties have consented to the entry of this Stipulated Permanent Injunction to resolve all matters of dispute between them in the above-entitled actions. Pursuant to the Court's November 15, 2012 Order, this proposed Stipulated Permanent Injunction contains all of the terms of the agreed-upon permanent injunction for this case.

### Permanent Injunction

Plaintiffs and up to (4) four persons acting in concert, shall be permitted to unfettered access without any ticket requirement the following areas in order to conduct their free speech activity (i.e., videotaping, displaying signs, leafletting, or otherwise protesting):

(1) A three (3)-foot wide walkway running alongside the perimeter wall of the animal compound. Defendants or Ringling Bros. may construct a fence to demark the three (3)-foot wide walkway on side of walkway opposite the perimeter wall of the animal compound of the Ringling Bros. Circus events, located on the North and East sides and West side to the frontage road entrance gate, at the Oracle Arena in Oakland, California, to create a corridor.

(2) The barricaded corridor leading to the animal compound, the area outside of but directly adjacent to the corridor, and the gap between the corridor and the animal compound entrance except that there shall be a ten-foot buffer zone surrounding the entrance of the compound. Plaintiffs may temporarily be moved from the gap to permit movement of equipment and animals.

(3) The upper west landing area, up to the point where the west ramp joins the landing.

(4) One specific spot located in the area adjacent to the entrance to the north tunnel, which has a clear view of the entire tunnel. Here, only one person rather than four shall be permitted access.

(5) The north ramp and landing.

(6) The northeast stairs and base of the stairs.

Furthermore, Plaintiffs and persons acting in concert with them should be permitted free access to all exterior areas of the Arena and parking lot which are otherwise open to the public.

Defendants are required to distribute copies of the preliminary injunction to any security manager, security guard, and/or police officer providing security at the Arena during the circus engagement. Moreover, all security personnel should be briefed as to the material terms of the injunction.

In addition, Defendants shall designate one “point person” during the entirety of the circus engagement at the Arena, who shall be responsible for communicating with Mr. Cuiello and Ms. Bolbol in the event of a dispute and who has the power to make immediate decisions in regard thereto.

The preliminary injunction need only apply to circus events scheduled at the Coliseum/Arena, such as the Ringling Brothers Circus.

The Court shall retain jurisdiction over any disputes that arise with respect to these cases and the permanent injunction is hereby entered.

**SO STIPULATED.**

Dated: November 26, 2012

GONZALEZ & LEIGH LLP

By: /s/ G. Whitney Leigh  
G. WHITNEY LEIGH  
Attorneys for Plaintiff  
DENIZ BOLBOL

Dated: November 26, 2012

/s/ Joseph Cuiello  
JOSEPH CUIELLO  
Plaintiff In Pro Per

1 Dated: November 26, 2012

BRAGG & KULUVA

2  
3 By: /s/ Stephen M. MacPhail  
STEPHEN M. MacPHAIL  
4 Attorneys for Defendants  
SMG, COUNTY OF ALAMEDA, RON  
5 LITTLE, LEROY "SKEET" ELLIS,  
6 OAKLAND-ALAMEDA COUNTY  
COLISEUM AUTHORITY and  
7 OAKLAND COLISEUM JOINT  
8 VENTURE

9 Dated: November 26, 2012

GRAY DUFFY, LLP

10  
11 By: /s/ Richard M. Williams  
RICHARD M. WILLIAMS  
12 Attorneys for Defendants CITY OF  
OAKLAND, OAKLAND POLICE  
13 OFFICER R. VALLADON, OAKLAND  
POLICE OFFICER R. VILLEGAS  
14

15 Therefore, Plaintiffs' motion for voluntary dismissal of is hereby **GRANTED**.

16 Upon the filing of this document, the Clerk of the Court shall enter a final judgment and close  
17 the file in this case.

18 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

19 Dated: 11/27/12

